The Subversive Songs of Bossa Nova: Tom Jobim in the Era of Censorship

Irna Priore and Chris Stover

Bossa nova flourished in Brazil at the end of the 1950s. This was a time of rapid development and economic prosperity in the country, following President Juscelino Kubitschek’s 1956 proclamation of “fifty years of progress in five,” but after the 1964 coup d’état, when General Humberto Castello Branco’s military regime took control of Brazil, the positive energy of the bossa nova era quickly dissipated.¹ Soon after the 1964 coup the atmosphere changed: civil rights were suppressed, political dissent was silenced, and many outspoken singer-songwriters, authors and playwrights, journalists, and academics were censored, arrested, and imprisoned. First-generation bossa nova artists, however, were able to avoid such persecution because their music was generally perceived as apolitical.² This essay challenges this perception by analyzing the ways in which iconic bossa nova composer Antônio Carlos (“Tom”) Jobim inscribed subversive political thought through musical syntax and lyrical allegory in several of his post-1964 songs. We begin by providing a brief overview of the socio-political history of 1960s Brazil, considering some general features of the Brazilian protest song (canção engajada) before focusing on Chico Buarque’s anthemic “Roda viva” as an exemplar of that style. We then move to a detailed examination of the Jobim compositions “Sabiá” and “Ligia,” the lyrics to both of which speak of love, longing, and saudade in the manner of many bossa nova songs, but within which can be found incisive (if carefully coded) critiques of the Castello Branco government. In order to contextualize these works, we will consider aspects of Jobim’s composition studies and describe his affinity with and incorporation of tonal and post-tonal compositional techniques. Because Brazil’s musical landscape—including much of its popular music—was highly informed by European art music syntax, this kind of analysis is relevant; indeed we believe that a careful consideration of such relationships is necessary for a sensitive hermeneutic look at Brazilian popular music generally.³ We will describe how meaning can be coded in harmony: how harmonic syntax can add layers of meaning that reinforce the covert meaning of words through the use of compositional techniques like deceptive motion, mode mixture, and chromatic modulation, similar to text painting in the European art song tradition. By contextualizing Jobim’s work through engagement with its contemporaneous political and artistic history, and by

¹ See Levine (1999, 125–31) for a general introduction to this period in Brazilian history.
² This was framed as a critique of the earlier practice by certain members of the second generation of bossa nova artists, who drew a stark distinction between what they termed linha conteudística (“content line”), which focused on topical, politically relevant lyrics, and what they considered to be the increasingly irrelevant linha formalística (“formal line”), which focused on melody, harmony, and gently romantic themes (Perrone 2002, 66).
³ While we could draw on much evidence in making such an assertion—see for instance Freeman (2006) and Veloso (2002, 149–51ff.)—perhaps there is no better source than poet/journalist Augusto de Campos’s playful but pointed comparison of João Gilberto and Anton Webern (Campos 1974, 313–31).
considering the influence of aspects of Jobim’s musical studies through sensitive analysis of the works themselves, we will make claims about the relationship between musical syntax, lyrical meaning, and political motivation.

**HISTORICAL BACKGROUND OF THE PROTEST MOVEMENT**

Soon after the installation of the military regime in March 1964, a student-led protest movement fomented, and while students represented only a small and comparatively elite segment of society, their opposition was visible and dramatic. In addition, political unions were often located within university campuses, which foregrounded the close interpenetration between student and worker activism. An increasing number of artists joined the activist cause, and the subsequent protest song movement, or canção engajada, materialized as an overt musical expression of criticism of the military government’s policies. The result was one of the most politically motivated musical trends in the history of Brazilian popular music. Artists began to adopt a sense of social responsibility since they believed they could directly reach the public, thereby providing an account of the political climate in Brazil.

An important catalyst for the rapid transformation of musical orientation and political motivation in the mid-1960s was singer Nara Leão, whose apartment in Ipanema had been an important meeting place for bossa nova artists since the inception of the movement. Leão had long been associated with the bossa nova scene in Rio de Janeiro, but as the political climate changed she increasingly felt the need to align the music with the protest movement. In December 1964 Leão joined nordestino singer/songwriter João do Vale and sambista Zé Keti in Augusto Boal’s theatrical show Opinião. Opinião was collectively produced by Teatro de Arena and members of the Centro Popular de Cultura (Center for Popular Culture), and brought a wide assortment of new songs in a variety of Brazilian styles together into a loose narrative, expressing unity and catharsis through the valorization of the common man. Leão’s hit song in Opinião was do Vale’s “Carcará” (“bird of prey”), to which the audience responded with “a shiver, as if the rebellion against dictator Marshall Castello Branco [was] being exposed right then and there. And each time that Nara ran her fingers through her bangs, it was as if

---

4 See Perrone (2002).
5 Castro (2000, 88–94) describes the frequent sessions bossa nova pioneers Carlos Lyra, Roberto Menescal, and Ronaldo Bôscoli (and soon João Gilberto) held in Leão’s apartment in 1957.
6 Teatro de Arena (1953–1972) was founded by Augusto Boal and was one of the most important theater groups of the time. It produced provocative works and was eventually shut down by the military government. Centro Popular de Cultura (or CPC) was a leftist group of intellectual activists that had, as their main goal, the promotion of revolutionary popular art. CPC was created by the União Nacional de Estudantes or UNE (National Student Coalition), which remains an important student union in Brazil. It was created in 1937 and throughout the years has assumed distinctly progressive political positions. In 1961, UNE had supported João Goulart’s leftist government, which was deposed in the military coup. Thereafter, UNE became one of the most outspoken critics of the military dictatorship. See Leu (2006, 3) and Dunn (2001, 52–54) for analyses of Opinião’s impact on contemporaneous Brazilian cultural life.
Castello Branco was being physically swept out of Brazilian life” (Castro 2000, 271).\footnote{See Dunn (2001, 53–54) for a lyrical analysis of do Vale’s “Carcará.”} With its explicit revolutionary tone, the show became a metonym for the protest song movement.

Leão went on to renounce bossa nova, asserting publicly the importance of aligning music with political action, and suggesting that bossa nova was elitist, intellectual, boring, and out of touch (Castro 2000, 267–69).\footnote{While the history of Leão’s transition from bossa nova into protest is well documented—in addition to Castro, see Campos (1974, 88–90) and Treece (1997, 16–17)—the music she made during this period is yet to be read closely; there is much room for future scholarly work here.} Her seemingly abrupt break with bossa nova in 1964, her embrace of the protest song agenda, and the impressive way she presented herself in the media as a fearless activist voice encouraged many popular musicians to consider the ways that they could become powerful agents for socio-political action.\footnote{While Leão’s transformation is often described as abrupt, Castro (ibid.) makes clear that Leão’s trajectory away from mainstream bossa nova began over a year before the military coup, which suggests that she was orienting herself in a radical musical direction that then dovetailed into activism.}

Many of the artists involved in the protest song movement received their first national attention at one of the widely popular 	extit{Festivals da Canções} (Song Festivals). In 1965, 	extit{TV Excelsior} sponsored the first Song Festival, ushering in an annual series that turned out to be among the decade’s most significant stages for emerging (and even established) Brazilian artists. Artists such as Chico Buarque, Edu Lobo, Geraldo Vandré, Caetano Veloso, and Gilberto Gil found early and important success through the festivals, and many of the songs they performed at the Song Festivals invoked sharp social commentaries. Buarque and Gil contributed songs that incorporated highly realistic evocations of the day-to-day life of the middle-class people in order to construct allegorical frameworks.\footnote{Buarque’s 1971 “Construção” and Gil’s 1968 “Domingo no parque” are two well-known examples: see Perrone (1993, 21–27, 98–99) for detailed lyrical analyses of both.} The songs of Lobo and Vandré often displayed an overt leftist agenda, incorporating Brazilian folk traditions, indexing indigenous musics and practices, and evoking affinities with the working poor in their songs (this will be unpacked further below). Veloso, on the other hand, engaged elements of pop culture, Dadaism, concrete poetry, musique concrète, and rock and roll in his songs in order to portray a poignant social and cultural alienation. Although there are important (and under-theorized) affinities in their music, and although both were exiled for the subversive content of their songs, Veloso and Gil were not generally considered to be part of the protest movement.\footnote{Caetano Veloso was a very controversial figure. He began as one of the politicized artists who embraced the protest song music, but soon distanced himself from it because he found the movement paternalist and dangerously nationalistic. In his book 	extit{Tropical Truth}, he calls himself “the left of the left” (Veloso 2002, 112) and his own aesthetics “tropicalism.” See Stover (2013) for a brief overview of the tropicalists’ political position and their relationship with Brazilian musical traditions including bossa nova (see especially p. 456 in this last regard). The relationship between Veloso and 	extit{Tropicália} on one hand, and 	extit{canção engajada} on the other, is extraordinarily complex. Dunn describes how the tropicalists lamented the Left’s lack of attention to racial issues, sexual equality, and subalternity, as well as the Left’s general “paternalistic and at times, ethnocentric populism” (2001, 155–56), and Leu (2006, 27) describes how Veloso “compared the bullying of the cultural left to that of the paramilitaries of the CCC.” Stover (2013, 455) describes this tropicalist stance as “meta-protest,” and Ridenti locates the tropicalists as an even more radical left—see Stover (2013, 469–552).}
Protest songs frequently conveyed a sense of frustration, loss, or anger through allegory, without mentioning the precise source of those emotions, since a direct criticism of the government would frequently result in censorship or worse. Many protest song lyrics suggested that a better day was ahead, a day when life would return to the state of (a perhaps idealized and imaginary) glorious past. Recurring themes in protest songs included calls to action, the exaltation of folk culture, and the valorization of the common man. Protest song artists avoided musical devices that would index foreign influences like the incorporation of jazz harmonies, which was a defining feature of bossa nova (but about which see below), or evocations of rock and roll, which came to symbolize, for one camp, anti-Brazilian colonialist sentiments, and for another, craven populism—this was the position the protest movement took against the contemporaneous jovem guarda (young guard), who fashioned their music after US and UK rock and roll. Instead, protest singers turned to melodic, harmonic, and rhythmic materials borrowed from, or based upon, folkloric Brazilian traditions.

**COMPOSITIONAL APPROACHES**

Protest songs frequently incorporated modes, stylized melodies, and harmonic patterns that either borrowed directly from or indexed Brazilian folk traditions. Common modes included Mixolydian, Aeolian, and the *modo nordestino* (“northeastern mode”), shown in Example 1. Melodies were typically linear and clearly articulated the harmonic progression, with sequential repetitions and periodic phrase rhythms. Songs featured regular harmonic rhythm, with modal triadic harmony, occasionally incorporating dominant seventh chords to articulate main cadences. Siqueira Tiné (2008) describes how modal harmonic practice in Brazilian music frequently contrasts “purely” modal harmonic motion (♭VII to i as a cadential gesture, for example) with local tonicizations that prolong harmonies within the modal terrain.
Siqueira Tiné (2008) describes how the modal cadence is sometimes used “when not all of the theme or melody is harmonized in a manner that belongs exclusively to this or that mode, but that at the point of the cadence, i.e. at the phrases that close sections, periods, sentences, etc., the succeeding harmony is given in a manner that avoids the dominant–tonic relation” (“quando a totalidade do tema ou melodia não está harmonizada de maneira a pertencer exclusivamente a este ou aquele modo, mas que, no momento cadencial, ou seja, nas frases que encerram seções, períodos, sentenças, etc, a sucessão harmônica se dá de maneira a evitar a relação D–T,” translated by Chris Stover).

One of the most celebrated Brazilian protest songs, Chico Buarque’s “Roda viva,” serves as a good illustration of these compositional approaches. Buarque was an outspoken and provocative artist, and had the most songs censored of any contemporaneous songwriter. In 1967 director José Celso produced Buarque’s play Roda viva, which depicted the life of a fictitious artist named Benedito Silva, his climb to success, and his final destruction (he commits suicide, after which the audience devours him quite literally—in the São Paulo production figurative pieces of the artist’s liver were offered to the actual audience to eat).

The play enraged audiences, censors, and the far right, including the CCC (Comando de caça

---

17 Siqueira Tiné (2008, 156) describes how the modal cadence is sometimes used “when not all of the theme or melody is harmonized in a manner that belongs exclusively to this or that mode, but that at the point of the cadence, i.e. at the phrases that close sections, periods, sentences, etc., the succeeding harmony is given in a manner that avoids the dominant–tonic relation” (“quando a totalidade do tema ou melodia não está harmonizada de maneira a pertencer exclusivamente a este ou aquele modo, mas que, no momento cadencial, ou seja, nas frases que encerram seções, períodos, sentenças, etc, a sucessão harmônica se dá de maneira a evitar a relação D–T,” translated by Chris Stover).

18 See fn 17 above. Siqueira Tiné (2008) also references more liberal contemporary “modal” definitions that align with those offered by Barry Kernfeld and Ron Miller. Waters (2011, 44–49) summarizes and comments on some of these conceptions.

19 McGowan and Pessanha (2008, 80) assert that only one in three of Buarque’s songs passed the government’s censorial ear during this period.

20 Celso was an important director in the 1960s experimental theater scene in São Paulo. He worked closely with Teatro Oficina, an amateur group associated with the University of São Paulo (USP) College of Law, including staging a notorious production of Oswald de Andrade’s O rei da vela (“The Candle King”) just prior to Roda viva. USP was an important center for political protest during the military dictatorship.

21 The expression roda viva means “wheel of life”; however, it can also mean “rat race,” the daily grind of routine life, something bigger than life itself that sweeps you away, or even “eats you up.”
aos comunistas, or Communist Hunting Command). During the production of June 17, 1968, the CCC invaded the stage, destroyed the sets and beat the actors, and soon after, when the play was to be produced in Porto Alegre, the CCC raided the hotel where the cast was staying, kidnapped two actors, and threatened them with execution.\textsuperscript{22} Although Buarque claimed the play was about an artist dealing with the increasingly intense scrutiny and adulation of his fans and not an activist statement, the government did not accept his explanation. The play was terminated and Buarque’s eponymous song censored.\textsuperscript{23}

Buarque’s “Roda viva” features several instances of text painting.\textsuperscript{24} For example, its final refrain repeats several times, accelerating with each repetition to suggest that in its constant spinning the world is getting away from (or overwhelming) us. The way the lead vocal melody and background chorus overlap into each others’ phrase boundaries adds another layer of circularity, as do the frequent and-of-two agogic accents that anticipate the next chord change.\textsuperscript{25} There is also a circular ebb and flow to the narrative—a question is asked, a hopeful gesture is made (gaining control of our own destiny in the first verse, cultivating a beautiful rose in the second, taking our guitar into the streets in the third, longing for time to stop in the fourth), which “roda viva” sweeps away. The plural meaning of “roda viva” (see footnote 25 above) is crucial here: the wheel of life, the rat race, but also a whirlwind that sweeps away everything that has been gained. Example 2 shows a transcription of the first verse–chorus of Buarque’s original studio recording.\textsuperscript{26}

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics{example2.png}
\caption{Chico Buarque’s “Roda viva,” first verse–chorus}
\end{figure}

\textsuperscript{22} See George (1992) for a detailed description of the experimental theater scene in mid-1960s São Paulo that further contextualizes Celso’s staging of Roda viva.
\textsuperscript{23} McGowan and Pessanha (2008, 80) describe this moment as “the death of ‘nice guy’ Chico Buarque.”
\textsuperscript{24} The complete lyrics with translations are provided in the Appendix.
\textsuperscript{25} The roda (as circle or wheel) is an important aspect of Afro-Brazilian cosmology and cultural practice, and infiltrates mainstream musical culture as well. Examples include the urban Afro-Brazilian samba de roda and the circular performance terrain of capoeira (both signifying on African precedents), and the circular forms and lyrical narratives of many songs. For an account of the nature and role of the roda in capoeira see Lewis (1992, 86–87, 193). For a detailed account of how circular musical forms and lyrical narratives are embedded in Brazilian popular music, see Stover (2015).
\textsuperscript{26} Transcription by Chris Stover.
While the melody is cast largely in a modal (Aeolian) B minor, the supporting harmonic progression is tonal, with cadential dominants (mm. 2, 4, and 8), circle-of-fifths motion (mm. 5–6), and tonicizations of V (mm. 4 and 7) and VI (m. 11). The chromatic tonicization of V in m. 7 supports the first appearance of the title phrase, “mas eis que chega a roda viva” (but here comes the wheel of life) and one of the only chromatic melody notes (the E♯, which is also reinforced by a rhythmic hit from the band). The tonicization of VI introduces a second chromatic note, the C in m. 11 supporting the melodic phrase “o tempo redou num instante” (time swirled in an instant), the weight of which presses into the final “nas voltas de meu coração” (in the spinning of my heart). Although very few people saw the play from which it originated, “Roda viva” became one of the most emblematic songs of the time, conveying a dramatic narrative arc that was at once general (that all could relate to) and deeply individualistic (with its strategic personal turns: “in the spinning of my heart”). Its emphatic ending—with a dramatic climax engendered by a rapidly accelerating tempo and progressively louder dynamics—brought audiences to their feet.27

TOM JOBIM’S TRAINING AND MUSICAL INFLUENCES

Tom Jobim is widely considered to be one of the three most important and innovative architects of bossa nova, along with singer/guitarist João Gilberto and poet/lyricist Vinícius de Moraes. His song “Chega de saudade,” with lyrics by de Moraes, was the first bossa nova

---

27 Video footage of Buarque’s 1967 festival performance can be seen at http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=fEY9Z8LfMY. This is a remarkable document, both because of the quality of the musicianship and because of the frequent cuts to the audience singing along, including several deeply moving shots.
record, released in 1958 (Gilberto’s “Bim bom” was the B side).

Many contemporary narratives describe how Jobim and other bossa nova artists were influenced by cool jazz, often locating bossa nova as something of a fusion of jazz harmony with samba. Reily (2006, 6), for instance, describes how

[n]ightlife for Rio’s upper class had moved out of the large big-band halls to the intimate dark setting of the nightclub, and such establishments were proliferating in the city’s affluent neighborhoods. The nightclub context called for a mellow musical style that could promote the romantic intimacy young dreamy-eyed couples were looking for. Musicians responded by experimenting with the models most readily available to them: the be-bop and jazz, particularly cool jazz, fusing them with the national material.

While the influence of jazz on bossa nova is significant, it is equally important to note the influence of the European art music tradition on Jobim’s harmonic and melodic syntax. Jobim started his studies in tonal harmony with composer and conductor Paulo Silva, and several teachers followed, including composers Alceo Bochino and Radamés Gnattali. Jobim was also acquainted with Heitor Villa-Lobos and frequently attended concerts at the celebrated composer’s house. At the recommendation of Villa-Lobos, Jobim studied piano and composition with the Spanish pianist Tomás Teran, to whom Villa-Lobos had dedicated several works. At age seventeen Jobim studied with the classical pianist Lúcia Branco, who introduced him to Chopin’s music. Arthur Moreira Lima, a concert pianist and fellow student, quotes Branco as saying: “This lad who comes after you wants to be a classical pianist. But he composes such beautiful songs that I think he should devote himself to his own works.

---

28 Despite the fact that Gilberto is credited with the creation of the “bossa nova beat” (see Priore 2008), he is more known as an interpreter than a composer. Moraes was one of Brazil’s most celebrated poets and a frequent collaborator of Jobim’s: the songs he co-wrote with Jobim in 1956 for the play Orfeu da Conceição (and even more so in 1959 with Marcel Camus’s renowned film Orfeu Negro, which included the iconic bossa nova hit “A felicidade”) helped solidify bossa nova’s central place in contemporaneous Brazilian popular culture. See Moreno (1982), Reily (1996), and Castro (2000).

29 We should emphasize that this thread in Reily’s essay is indicative of the degree to which bossa nova musicians (and sometimes the scholars that engage their music) try to distance themselves from jazz—it is difficult to read Jobim’s comment that he “rarely listened to jazz, and knew very little about the procedures employed by jazz musicians” (ibid., 9) as anything but sarcastic or dissimilative (see below for examples of Jobim’s sarcastic wit when speaking publicly), and the examples Reily (2006, 10) cites (fluctuating between clearly tonal and more nebulous harmonic passages, “using major chords with supertonic function,” and so on) are hallmarks of contemporaneous jazz practice that only reinforce Jobim’s connection to it.

30 Silva was a well-known teacher, conductor, and composer, who taught at the Instituto Nacional de Música and the Conservatório Nacional do Canto Orfeônico in Rio de Janeiro. Bocchino is a well-known conductor and pianist who taught at the Academia Lorenzo Fernandez in Rio de Janeiro. Gnattali was a composer, arranger, pianist, and conductor whose work subtended concert and popular Brazilian music genres in important and influential ways.

31 Much of the way Jobim invokes early twentieth-century tonal and post-tonal syntax is filtered through his experience with Villa-Lobos, as Reily (1996, 9) and Freeman (2006, 92) both observe. Freeman (2006, 75–79) also describes how the particular ways that Villa-Lobos subtended Western concert music idioms and nationalistic (and folkloric) Brazilian musical styles were highly influential on younger Brazilian composers, Jobim included. See also Behague (1994).

32 Lúcia Branco was a famous pianist and teacher.
This ‘lad’ was Tom Jobim.” Jobim was enthralled with the music of Chopin, believing that Chopin had worked out many of the compositional problems that he was wrestling with. Jobim commented, “How is it possible that someone that was born a thousand years ago already knew everything I want to know now?” Chopin’s influence on Jobim was profound, ranging from a rich and structurally complex tonal syntax featuring mode mixture, third-related harmonic motions, and projections of large-scale voice-leading relations, to linear bass progressions incorporating many nuanced chord inversions, to a general emphasis on inner-voice counterpoint not typically found in contemporaneous jazz. Freeman (2006, 177–78, 180–87) describes the specific influence that Chopin’s music had on Jobim, including a number of occasions when Jobim references specific Chopin compositions: Jobim’s “Insensatiz” (“How Insensitive”) is modeled on Chopin’s Prelude in E minor, op. 28, no. 4, and Jobim’s “Retrato em branco e preto” (“Picture in Black and White”) borrows from Chopin’s Étude, op. 10, no. 6.

Jobim was introduced to twentieth-century music by one of his early teachers, the famous conductor and composer Hans-Joachim Koellreuter. Koellreuter introduced Jobim to Debussy’s music, twelve-tone techniques, and more, and encouraged Jobim to compose intricate works that combined nineteenth- and twentieth-century European compositional practices. Jobim describes how Koellreuter was a good soul and a very demanding teacher. He taught me many practical things including the idea of the twelve-tone method, of non-tonal music, of not having a tonal center and to use all twelve pitches of the piano. One day, I had lunch with Koellreuter at [the restaurant] Plataforma, and I teased him: ‘So, do you still continue with your twelve tones?’ He answered me: ‘of course, and how about you?’ Well, I use now thirty five, which are the sounds of classical music. The seven white notes, plus seven flats, seven double-flats, seven sharps, and seven double-sharps. Seven times five

---

33 “Esse rapaz que vem depois da sua aula quer ser pianista clássico. Mas ele faz músicas tão lindas, que devia se dedicar ao seu próprio trabalho. O rapaz era Tom Jobim” (translated by Irna Priore).
34 “meu Deus, o que é isso? Como é que um sujeito que nasceu há mil anos já sabia de tudo que eu quero saber agora?” (translated by Irna Priore). This exaggeration is typical of Tom Jobim’s humor.
35 See Stover (2014) for an analysis of Jobim’s “Desafinado” that speaks to some of these points.
36 For an excellent illustration, listen to Jobim’s accompaniments of Elis Regina on the 1974 Elis e Tom—Jobim can frequently be heard singing, from the piano, chromatic guide-tone countermelodies to Regina’s melodic interpretations. This recording also includes a number of songs that draw in different ways on European art music syntax, from the chromatic neighbor motion of “Retrato em branco e preto” to the rigorous motivic cohesion of “Pois é” to the art-song sensibility of “Modinha.”
37 Koellreuter, a former composition student of Paul Hindemith, emigrated to Brazil during Hitler’s rise to power in Germany. At the end of the Second World War, he returned to Europe and taught at the Darmstadt Summer Course for New Music in Germany and at the Centro Internazionale di Musica Contemporanea de Milano. He returned to Brazil in 1974, where he remained until the end of his life and taught and influenced many Brazilian composers.
38 For example, Freeman (2006, 112–17) notes several overt instances of Jobim borrowing harmonic techniques from Debussy; namely in the songs “Passarim” and “Surfboard.”
equals 35 and these are pitches you can write on a staff. He [Koellreuter] only allows himself to use twelve; he is so impoverished.39

Jobim’s music is saturated with complex chromatic modulations, deceptive cadences, ambiguous harmonic centers, and even moments of atonality. All of this reflects his deep engagement as a student: with Chopin, but also with Debussy, Ravel, Stravinsky, the twelve-tone composers, and more. Jobim’s musical education and exposure to a variety of repertoires placed him in a unique position in relation to other popular composers of the time. Jazz was certainly an influence on his music, but just one among many.40

Jobim wrote 303 songs, but only a few of them may be considered political: “Retrato em Preto e Branco” and “Sabiá” (1968), “Ilha Maria” and “Pois é” (1970), “Águas de Março” and “Ligia” (1972), “Matita Perê” (1973), and “Carta a Vinicius” (1977).41 The following examination will focus on “Sabiá” and “Ligia.”

“SABIÁ”

Following the success of his 1962 Carnegie Hall concert, Jobim remained in the United States, living in Los Angeles and composing, arranging, performing, and recording through 1966. He returned to Brazil in 1967 and in the same year he was invited to serve as a judge for the International Song Festival. He declined, but then felt compelled to submit a song for the contest as an apology for his decision. He called Chico Buarque to help him with this project. The resulting song, “Sabiá,” ended up winning at the national festival, and the song moved on to the international phase of the competition.42 The success of “Sabiá” was highly controversial; it was not the audience’s favorite and won amidst furious protest and jeering.


40 The degree to which jazz influenced bossa nova remains highly contentious, and indeed, a definitive analysis of their interpenetration remains to be written. See Tinhorão (1966) and Behague (1973) for two accounts that describe the degree to which the Brazilian media excoriated the “Yankee imperialist” incursion of jazz, and the pains they took to describe alternative narratives. Freeman (2006, 6–8) unpacks some of this debate, also drawing connections to earlier Brazilian scholars like Gilberto Freyre, foregrounding ongoing issues of Brazilian musical identity. Note that this debate has been a central focus of Brazilian political and cultural discourse throughout the twentieth century and beyond; indeed, the entire Tropicalist project (see fn 11 above) involved inverting the Brazilian/“foreign” binary in order to foreground Brazilian identity as essentially hybrid—this was directly in line with (and influenced by) Oswald de Andrade’s imperative in his Manifesto Antropofágico (“Cannibalist Manifesto”), about which much has been written (see Dunn 2002, Leu 2006, and Stover 2013).

41 While this list is somewhat subjective, these songs were composed during the harshest years of the dictatorship and can be read unproblematically as having politically subversive subtexts. A complete list of Jobim’s songs can be found at http://www.jobim.com.br/cgi-bin/clubedotom/musicas3.cgi (accessed 17 October 2014).

42 There were two phases of the International Song Festival: national, where local artists competed among themselves; and international, where winners of the national phase competed with other countries’ winners.
While the audience preferred Geraldo Vandré’s powerful activist anthem “Caminhando (Pra não dizer que não falei das flores),” the festival authorities felt it would be politically embarrassing to send such a politically charged song to represent Brazil abroad, so “Sabiá” was chosen instead.43 A very sophisticated song on many levels (to be discussed below), “Sabiá” was not considered political at the time, even though its lyrics narrate a story of exile and dissatisfaction.

The lyrics of “Sabiá” reterritorialize the 1843 poem “Canção do exílio” (Song of Exile), written by poet Antônio Gonçalves Dias when he was a law student in Coimbra, Portugal.44 Both texts speak through a first-person narrator longing for a far-away home. But while in “Canção do exílio” the sentimental text promises an eventual return to its sweetly remembered palm trees, flowers in multitudes, and the song of the wood thrush, in “Sabiá” the narrator longs for a home that no longer exists as remembered: the palm tree is gone, the flowers do not grow, and the song of the wood thrush is only a memory.45 The new reality—a broken, lifeless place—contrasts sharply with the joyous and vital past. The transformation from a remembered (or imagined) utopian past into an untenable present is a common theme of protest songs, and the nature of those responsible for that transformation, while rarely explicitly called out, is never far from the surface. Furthermore, the future described in protest songs is nearly always hopeful; a time where freedom, joy, and prosperity would return, where the people would rebuild the land, and the dictatorship’s censors, prisons, torture, and exiles would be swept away.46 “Sabiá” is no exception. While “Sabiá” describes a bleak picture of the home to which the narrator is eventually returning, there are clear indications of hopefulness: a possible love affair, the announcement of a new day, the thought that all will not be in vain.

The harmonic complexity of “Sabiá” is daunting: it seems to be in D major, with B minor looming large as a secondary key area, but over the course of its unfolding this major / relative minor duality is problematized through a number of radical harmonic motions. And while its large-scale harmonic plan is ambiguous and plural, its local harmonic movements are even more so, as voice-leading motions engender extreme harmonic shifts, all in the service of explicating the hidden meanings in the text. Example 3 shows the melody and chords in lead sheet notation. This reduction is based on Eumir Deodata’s score, with modifications that

---

43 We will return briefly to “Caminhando” below.
44 Antônio Gonçalves Dias was a poet and dramatist, and “Canção do exílio” is one of his most well-known poems in Brazil. It has been indexed and quoted many times throughout Brazilian history, including a reference in the Brazilian national anthem, and in parodies by Casimiro de Abreu, Carlos Drummond de Andrade, and Oswald de Andrade, among others. For more discussion on the lyrics of “Sabiá,” including their relation to “Canção do exílio,” see Mammi, Lorenzo, and Nestroviski (2004). The texts and translations of “Canção do Exílio” and “Sabiá” are provided in the Appendix.
45 There is also an allusion here to a general waning interest in bossa nova; that bossa nova too is gone.
46 The theme of rebirth or rebuilding is pervasive in contemporaneous musical practice: see Buarque’s “Apesar de você,” where he sings that “in spite of you, tomorrow will be a new day.” The titles of Gilberto Gil’s early seventies albums Refavela (“re-favela,” suggesting that a do-over of the favelas [slums] is imminent) and Refazenda (“remaking”) play on this theme too.
reflect both Jobim’s and Buarque’s recorded versions. Chords that differ in Buarque’s version are shown in smaller font above Jobim’s chords.

Example 3. Lead sheet reduction of “Sabiá”

More accurately, Example 3 reflects careful consultation with three primary sources: Chico Buarque’s 1968 recording, Jobim’s 1970 recording on Stone Flower, and Deodata’s arrangement (available at http://www2.uol.com.br/tomjobim/mp_sabia.htm). Deodata’s is the “official” version that was published posthumously in Cancionero Tom Jobim (Jobim 2001) and is based on a conflation of Jobim’s 1970 recording and a later version that appears on the posthumous CD Jobim Inédito. A number of discrepancies between various recordings and Deodata’s arrangement were resolved by consulting a fourth source, a remarkable solo performance by Jobim that suggests that the sheet music chords for the first four bars of each chorus are correct, and that the recorded versions were nuanced alterations of Jobim’s urtext. Jobim’s performance can be heard at http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GTKLhg5gAFLo (accessed 30 October 2014). Note that in reducing “Sabiá” to lead sheet notation Example 3 suppresses many inner-voice and contrapuntal melodic shapes that Jobim considered fundamental to the song’s identity; see fn 36 above for more on the prevalence of inner-voice melodic motion in Jobim’s music.
Example 3 continued.
The first-inversion DMaj7 chord that supports the opening “vou voltar” introduces a degree of tonal instability that will play out as the song unfolds. That instability will manifest through deceptive resolutions, mode mixture, and repurposings of harmonic functions. After passing through a diminished seventh chord (supporting descending chromatic motion in the bass), a ii–V leads back to a second iteration of I6/5 (the first-inversion DMaj7); this subtle deflection of tonic resolution engenders the motion through another passing diminished seventh chord back to a second of iteration of ii (m. 7), which turns out retrospectively to be the iv of a iv–V (mm. 7–8) to a local tonic B minor. This supports the text “Vou voltar, se que ainda vou voltar para o meu lugar foi lá” (I will return; I know that I will return to my place that was there). The B minor arrival, however, projects a descending chromatic motion (mm. 10–12) supporting the continuation of the text “e é ainda lá” (and it is still there), resulting in something of a semantic conflict between the text and its harmonic trajectory. What are we to make of the sentimental notion that home is still there as remembered, and the fraught, wayward path that the chromatic descent takes? The semantic conflict is amplified by a brief period of modal harmonic motion (GMaj7 to F♯min7 to Emin, in a local B minor space; mm. 13–15) on “still there,” which we should read as a signifier for the protest song movement—leading “Sabiá” briefly into a modal harmonic space (minor v–iv in b minor). The descending chromatic motion repeats as we first hear of the song of the titular wood thrush (“cantar uma Sabiá”; mm. 18–21). If the wood thrush is a metonym for the many remembered images that are soon to be introduced, the chromatic nature of its harmonic accompaniment should give us pause: we don’t know yet that the palm tree is gone or that the flowers do not grow or that the song thrush no longer sings, but the harmony in this passage provides a subtle musical foreshadowing.

In the second chorus, the same opening harmony supports “vou voltar,” but a stark transformation interrupts the narrative as the harmony modulates abruptly to F major (m. 29), supporting the text “Vou deitar à sombra de uma palmeira que já não há” (I will lay down in the shadow of a palm tree that no longer exists)—the word “shadow” (sombra) is supported by a mode shift from F major to F minor, and through that harmonic transformation the true condition of the narrator’s home is revealed. What follows is the most harmonically fraught passage in the song. The discovery that the palm tree is no more (mm. 33–35) and that the flower no longer grows (“a flor que já não dá”; mm. 36–39) unfolds through strikingly complex chromaticism, with motions through several local keys, ambiguous diminished chords rather than clear tonicizations, and again an ambivalent tonal/modal interplay manifested as two C minor arrivals within a local context of F minor. The melody here becomes comparatively static, repeating a chromatic neighbor-note motif several times in a protracted descending sequence. It is precisely that neighbor-note motif, though, that enacts the semantic transformation offered by the suggestion that “a love affair will shoo away the unwanted nights and announce a new day” (e algum amor talvez possa espantar as noites que eu não

---

48 The interplay between pre-dominant functioning ii and iv chords is something of a Jobim hallmark: see Stover (2014) for an analysis of how this interplay, and the denial or fulfillment of expectation that it engenders, unfolds in the early Jobim composition “Desafinado.”
queria, e anunciar o dia); here the harmony supporting “a love affair” (algum amor; mm. 40–41) reaches its most distant and poignant apex, with the rising chromatic bass driving the verb “to shoo away” (espantar; m. 42), and as it points toward the announcement of a new day, its tonal ambiguity gradually clears up. It does this via an extended, complete chromatic descent from F minor down to a dominant-functioning A7(4–3) that leads back to (a still slightly ambiguous) D major and the third verse (m. 53).

The final announcement of the narrator’s imminent return is accompanied by a hopeful promise that “it will not be in vain” (não vai ser em vão). Here the melody rises dramatically, supported by another F major chord (m. 61) that this time is approached by its own tonally unambiguous ii–V (Gmin to C7; mm. 59–60). Thus far we have heard many major-to-minor modal shifts, but here minor gives way to major in a semantically and rhetorically powerful way. What follows is that litany of self-deceptive gestures beginning with the falling thirds motion B♭Maj7 to Gmin7 to Dmin7 (mm. 63–65): “como fiz enganos de me encontrar” (like mistakes I made of finding myself), “como fiz estradas de me perder” (like roads I opened to lose myself), “fiz de tudo e nada de te esquecer” (I tried everything and nothing could make me forget you). The rhetoric here is unusual; first the suggestion that one’s actions were “not in vain,” and then describing those actions, as if to defer causality in order to linger on the ambiguity and multiplicity of the rhetorical claim. The narrative is accompanied by the most harmonically simple part of the song, a gently oscillating G minor to D minor modal space that (a) again signifies the modal syntax of contemporaneous protest songs, and (b) introduces a new tonal region that adds one more node to an incomplete but very structurally salient minor-third complex that begins with D major, moves down to B minor and up to F major, and then to F major’s parallel minor. This is all shown in Example 4.

The large-scale tonal plan shown in Example 4 has compelling ramifications for an analysis that subtends textual meaning and harmonic motion. While “Sabiá” seems to be in D, its tonal identity is colored by extended and structurally significant shifts to B minor (the

---

**Example 4.** Large-scale tonal plan of “Sabiá”
relative minor), F major (the relative major of the parallel minor), and F minor (F major’s parallel minor). Even its D-centricity is questionable: there is no strong V–I motion in either Jobim’s or Buarque’s version (cadences in Jobim’s version point to first-inversion tonic chords, while in Buarque’s recording the V chord is in first inversion), and the extended final phrase prolongs plagal motion in D minor (G minor – D minor) as the narrator relates all of the ways that self-deception played into his particular mode of remembrance. This is further problematized by the instrumental coda, a reduction of which is shown in Example 5. Here a D pedal is sustained while a new instrumental melody outlines the whole-tone subsets: A–F–B, B♭–E–A♭, G–E♭–A, and G–C♯–F. This moment of surprising atonality gives way (in Jobim’s 1970 recording, at least) to lush D major harmony, but which is immediately interrupted by a final descent to an ambiguous B9 sonority with only a passing hint of a minor third, and it is with this ambiguity that the song ends. It is very likely that Jobim intended those whole-tone sonorities, and likewise the final flute melody, to represent the wood thrush: Jobim was interested in how harmonic and melodic devices could represent nature, as evidenced in a comment he made regarding Debussy: “those harmonies, those undulations to minor third, major third above or below, the whole-tone scales: all of it is connected to nature.”

The harmonic techniques Jobim employs in “Sabiá” are highly sophisticated, involving chromatic manipulations, careful redirections of harmonic trajectories, and denials of

Example 5. “Sabiá” coda (reduction)

49 Or her: see also Elis Regina’s 1980 recording on Saudades do Brasil, as well as the performance by sisters Cynara and Cybele at the TV Festival (about which see below).

teleological expectations that amplify the plurality of textual meanings in the song. How do these harmonies support a reading that points to a political subtext? “Sabiá” was written in 1968, four years into the military dictatorship. Its narrator is returning to a home that is no more: the iconic imagery of that home (the wood thrush, the palm tree, the flower) exists only in memory, and even the thought of a love affair is not enough to dispel the tragic sense of loss. There is a glimmer of hope in the second half of the song; that to return will not be in vain. But even in that hope there is a defeatist subtext of self-deception; that hope is illusory, that new roads only lead to increasing loss. A significant turn occurs at the very end of the text: “fiz de tudo e nada / de que esquecer” (I tried everything and nothing could make me forget you). This marks the first appearance in the entire song of an actual object, “you.” Here the song’s implicit meaning multiplies—the “you” of home, the “you” of a metaphorical lost love, the “you” of the pre-dictatorship promise of Brazilian progress. That the extraordinarily delayed introduction of an object appears in the most tonally ambiguous part of the song (is the final tonic resolution in D minor or major?) only reinforces its plural interpretation. The unforgettable “you” of home clearly has a political subtext, especially when we consider that the return described in the text is not a physical return; that is, the narrator never actually left. The “you” of lost love aligns with one of the most common metaphors in protest song: describing the narrator’s incisive feelings about the ongoing political climate in terms that on the surface read as a lovers’ quarrel or the protestations of a recently ended relationship.

Although it is rare to find critics associating Jobim with the political movement, there are a few who do. In a 1970 interview, the journalist and political activist Carlos Lacerda discussed “Sabiá.” Lacerda (1970) explained how

[Jobim] is 43 now. And he has one booing [to his account]. It was the booing of the Song Festival at Maracanã [stadium], when the jury gave him the first prize for his song “Sabiá” and second for Geraldo Vandré’s “Para não dizer que não falei das flores.” This song [“Sabiá”] is a protest song in disguise, which heightens its intensity; it is a kind of a shy “Guantanamera.” It is a beautiful example of the genre, easy to sing in group, appropriate for the festival. In other circumstances, the public would rather have sung a love song. There, the vibration was obvious. “Sabiá” is not a song to arouse multitudes, but it is a song to elevate the heart. It is a work of art. The lyrics, especially the Luso-Brazilian [texts] are heaven-bound in this song.52

51 Significantly, Jobim wrote the music for Glauber Rocha’s 1964 film Deus e o diabo na terra do sol (“God and the Devil in the Land of the Sun,” released in the US as Black God, White Devil). This was one of the most provocative movies of the time, with an allegorical story that was harshly critical of the political climate. While Jobim’s involvement in this project might serve as further evidence of his ongoing, if not always overt, political engagement, it is also important to note that Rocha’s film was made in 1963, a year before the military takeover. 52 “São 43 anos agora. E uma vaia. A vaia do Festival da Canção, no Maracanãzinho, quando o júri lhe deu o 1º prêmio pela sua canção Sabiá e o 2º a Geraldo Vandré, Para não dizer que não falei de flores. Esta é uma canção de protesto disfarçada, o que lhe aumenta a intensidade; uma espécie de Guantanamera encabulada. Uma bela peça do gênero, fácil de cantar em córo, própria para Festival. Noutra situação; o público preferiria amor. Ali, a frequência era óbvia. Sabiá não é canção de levantar multidões, é canção de levantar coração. É apenas uma
Lacerda’s argument that this is an easy song to sing is curious. With its frequent, surprising harmonic and melodic redirections, it presents many pitfalls for the interpreter; perhaps this is the reason why it has rarely been covered, compared to many songs in Jobim’s songbook. His assertion that the song was appropriate for the festival is equally curious. Every account of its reception describes a deafening chorus of boos; this is clearly audible in the archival footage. The performance itself, by sisters Cynara and Cybele, is modestly charming, but Jobim and Buarque seem awkward and even embarrassed as they flank the singers on stage in front of the largely hostile audience.53

On the other hand, the audience favorite, Vandré’s “Caminhando (Prá não dizer que não falei das flores)” was a veritable anthem: easy to sing, with a simple modal melody and oscillating i→♭VII triadic progression, and a catchy refrain. A transcription of “Caminhando” is shown in Example 6.54 The lyrics and translation appear in the Appendix.55

---

Example 6. Geraldo Vandré’s “Caminhando (Prá não dizer que não falei das flores)”

---

obra-prima. A lírica, especialmente luso-brasileira, toma o rumo do céu, nessa canção” (translated by Irna Priore). “Guantanamera” is a well-known Cuban political song.
54 Transcription by Chris Stover.
55 See Perrone (2002, 73) and Stover (2013, 459–60) for textual analyses.
Jobim wrote “Ligia” in 1972, and it was first recorded by Chico Buarque in 1974 on the album *Sinal Fechado* (Red Light), an album devoted entirely to covers. As described above, Buarque’s music had been censored since the mid-1960s (resulting in a period from 1969 to 1972 that Buarque spent in self-imposed exile in Rome) and everything he did was considered provocative by the Brazilian government. His decision to record an album of covers was something of a strategic workaround: although many of his own songs had been censored, he was able to record songs by other composers. While even the album title itself was provocative (it came from a song written by Paulinho da Viola that appears on the album), it passed the censors and was released in 1974.

Buarque modified Jobim’s lyrics for his 1974 recording, and Jobim subsequently adopted Buarque’s new text for his recording the following year. Both versions are provided in the Appendix; first Jobim’s original lyrics and then Buarque’s version, with key aspects of the differences between the two—some of which will figure prominently in the analysis below—

---

56 Jobim recorded “Ligia” the following year, with a lush arrangement by Claus Ogerman, for the Warner Brothers LP *Urubu*.

57 Famed samba performer and composer Paulinho da Viola wrote a number of songs during this period that expressed activist sentiments, including especially those that indexed Afro-Brazilian solidarity. See Júnior (2012).

58 Buarque was well aware that some songs could escape the ire of the government simply because their authors were not directly associated with the protest song movement, so it was a logical choice for him at the time to make this recording. Still, the album contains some very important political songs, including Noel Rosa’s “Filosofia” and a new song, “Acorda amor,” credited to unknown composer Julinho da Adelaide. In fact, Julinho da Adelaide was a pseudonym Buarque created in order to escape censorship. Buarque gave full life to Julinho da Adelaide, creating life stories and newspaper interviews, and two famous songs are “authored” by Adelaide: “Acorda amor” (Wake up, my love), which appears on *Sinal Fechado*, and “Jorge maravilha” (Marvelous George). Buarque was unmasked in 1974 when the newspaper *Journal do Brasil* revealed Julinho da Adelaide’s identity, but not before these songs were released under the censors’ radar. See Motta (2000) for a detailed account of Buarque’s dissimilation.
highlighted in italics. The analysis below follows the lead sheet reduction shown in Example 7, which is based on Paulo Jobim’s arrangement (from Jobim’s official website), with annotations that reflect discrepancies between that source, Buarque’s version from Sinal Fechado, and Jobim’s recording from the 1976 album Urubu.⁵⁹

“Ligia” is in C major, but a convincing tonic is never offered. Instead, it is hinted at, evaded, transformed: everything in the song, all the way to the haunting final ♭II chord, eludes a key-affirming tonic arrival while reinforcing C major’s centricity in more subtle ways. The harmonic gesture that opens the first phrase is a common trope in contemporaneous jazz (and in the American popular songbook that inspired jazz), ii–V diverted to iii and then falling through a passing diminished seventh chord back to a second iteration of ii.⁶⁰ This ii, though, is a half-diminished seventh chord, borrowed from the parallel C minor, and moves to V in m.

Example 7. Lead sheet reduction of “Ligia”

⁵⁹ Paulo Jobim’s arrangement is itself a piano reduction of the version from Jobim’s recording, and takes into account aspects of Jobim’s harmony and voice leading as well as details from Claus Ogerman’s orchestration. Transcription by Chris Stover.
⁶⁰ Adair and Dennis’s “Everything Happens to Me” and Edwards and Meyer’s “For Heaven’s Sake” are two of many examples of American popular songs that begin with this gesture.
6 as expected. Tonic (whether minor or major) is surely expected at this point, but the striking next move is to another 3 in the bass, this time supporting a dominant-functioning E chord, E9sus moving to E7(#5/#9), suggesting a motion to A minor. The move to E is even more striking since through the mode mixture of the iiø7 chord, the very real possibility of a C minor arrival was introduced. E7 resolves deceptively to F (VI of A minor; m. 9), though, to begin the next phrase, which in turn engenders a rising chromatic motion in the bass: F—F♯ø7—Emin/G—Amin9, inverting the descending chromatic motion of measures 3 to 5. The deceptive resolution of E7, therefore, is prolonged through that ascending chromatic motion to the expected A minor (m. 12), and its ultimate dominant approach is through E minor (m. 11); that is, a modal v. To add further to the harmonic complexity of this passage, A minor steps down to F♯ø7 (m. 13), which becomes the ii of a ii–V in E minor, but which resolves deceptively once again, to E major. The E major resolution should also make us go back and retroactively reconsider our interpretation of E minor as a modal dominant of A minor; perhaps A minor is instead a transient chord in a local E minor, as E moves down through pre-dominant harmony to the ii–V that will eventually reveal E major as a locally centric harmonic space. Finally, E major is diverted once again through A7 (IV dominant; m. 15) supporting the word “não” (no), which is revealed as V of ii when it gives way to the D minor chord, which in turn falls to ♭II (D♭7sus) as a tritone substitution for the dominant chord that takes us back to the top of the form and the second verse. The return to ii accompanies the first utterance of “Ligia,” which is repeated hauntingly over the D♭ chord in mm. 16–17.

Example 8 maps out this harmonic motion, with annotations that describe the various deceptions, redirections, and mode mixtures that define its unfolding.

The relevance of all of these nuanced harmonic shifts to the text is telling. “Ligia” begins with a series of negations: “eu nunca sonhei com você” (I never dreamed about you), “nunca fui ao cinema” (I never went to the movies), “não gosto de samba” (I don’t like samba), “não vou a Ipanema” (I don’t go to Ipanema), “não gosto de chuva” (I don’t like rain), “nem gosto de sol” (nor do I like the sun). These negations are reinforced by the continuous evasions of harmonic trajectories, as every promise of harmonic closure—even (especially) the bright E major sonority that accompanies “I was going to say”—is denied. A parallel to the self-deprecating narrative of Dennis and Adair’s “Everything Happens to Me” (which begins with the same harmonic motion; see footnote 60 above) is easy to find here: in the opening lines, “I make a date for golf and you can bet your life it rains” and “I try to give a party and the guy upstairs complains,” the first lyrical turn, “rains,” is supported by the chromaticism of a passing diminished seventh chord, while “guy upstairs complains” introduces mode mixture as an expected minor seventh chord is replaced by a half diminished seventh, the ii of a minor ii–V.

The deceptive F major arrival in measure 9 offers an opportunity to examine the relationship between harmony and meaning more closely. Regardless of how it is generated (in this case, via the transformation of 3’s identity into a dominant-functioning harmony), an arrival on IV at the next phrase beginning is not unusual, even expected. As the bass rises
from F major to F♯o7 to support the text “e quando eu lhe telefonei, desliguei” (and when I called you, I hung up), we might easily expect that F♯o7 chord to move to a dominant-functioning G chord and to take us, sooner or later, back to C. But instead we get E minor over a G bass (m. 11) supporting “foi engano” (wrong number); the expected harmonic trajectory is diverted, but why? The text here is very cryptic: “I hung up, wrong number” seems innocent enough—but if a dialing error was made then why not just dial again? But the problem seems more intractable, since the narrator goes on to suggest (or admit) that “o seu nome e não sei” (I don’t know your name), revealing a fraught, paradoxical relationship with the object of the song’s narrative. Some of this aporia is unpacked in the text that follows (“Esqueci no piano as bobagens de amor que eu iria dizer”—I forgot, at the piano, all the foolish words of love I was going to say), suggesting either a willful forgetting or an overwhelming catharsis brought on by the narrator’s musical rhapsodizing. The harmonic motion supports both readings here as the increasingly ambivalent circling-around of C gives way to a clear and unimpeachable, but quite unexpected, local E major: that E chord rises from the meandering chromatic

---

61 In Portuguese, the word engano literally means “a mistake,” and it is a common expression used when dialing a wrong number.
motion of the first part of the song to offer a brief ray of light on the word “to say” (dizer), but while the name “Ligia” is just around the corner, there is first a resigned “no” as the achievement of E major harmony gives way to a fatalistic return to the ambiguous home key. This is perhaps the most remarkable moment in the opening verse: the way in which, upon the first invocation of the object’s name (Ligia) the song’s harmonic uncertainty returns immediately. Of course the narrator knows Ligia’s name, but that becomes only the most central and thematizing of the many self-deceptions that have emerged thus far in the song.

The self-deception continues into the second chorus, this time of the petulant “I never wanted you anyway” (or in Jobim’s version, “I never fell in love”) response to a lover’s scorn. Buarque’s version adds an important and subtle musical detail as the bass waits until beat three of the first bar to enter, further intensifying the ambiguity; in other words, the Dmin to D♭7 motion (ii to ♭II) that should have gone to C but is instead diverted back to Dmin is only affirmed two beats later when the bass enters; note that the melody here is fluid enough that it could be supported by either tonic or pre-dominant harmony. As the second verse unfolds, gaps in the story are filled in, but further points of ambiguity are introduced; further spaces for plural interpretation opened. “I scratched out your name, I composed a samba canção about the lies ... that I heard from you” (O seu nome rasguei, fiz um samba-canção das mentiras [de amor] que aprendi com você)—if we bracket the adjectival “of love” we have an apposite evocation of Buarque’s 1970 “Apesar de você,” in which he does exactly that, composing a lovely samba that hides an incisive political critique in a text that on the surface reads as the bitter end of a love affair (but about which Buarque continually reasserts that “in spite of you, tomorrow will be another day”—see footnote 13 above). Buarque’s words only intensify plural meanings that had been embedded in Jobim’s original text, which describe the inevitability of suffering and loss: “Inevitably, I would suffer so much pain, and then lose you in the end” (Fatalmente eu iria sofrer tanta dor, pra no fim te perder). But they also ascribe more agency than Jobim’s original text would admit, as “I never fell in love” is replaced with “And when I fell in love,” and earlier, in the first verse Jobim describes the foolish words of love “that I heard from you,” while Buarque relocates those words as his own: the foolish words of love that I was going to say.

Some important textual implications are revealed as the third and final verse comes to a close. The F♯ø7 arrival, leading through B7 to a now expected (since it has happened twice already in a regularly strophic form) E major, supports the text “mas seus olhos morenos me metem mais medo que um raio de sol” (but your dark eyes bring me more fear than a sun’s ray). We can now retroactively interpret the “ray of light” E major chord alluded to early—the sun’s ray instills fear (fear of being seen?), but not as much fear as Ligia’s eyes (fear of being watched?). Note that this closing line is found in both Jobim’s original lyrics and in Buarque’s version. Clearly, lyricist Buarque was not the only politically subversive contributor to “Ligia,”

---

62 The “ray of light” cliché here is intentional; see the commentary on the third chorus below.
even if he was more well known as such at the time.\textsuperscript{63}

Tom Jobim was not an overt political activist but he has hinted at his political leanings in some public interviews, including one revealing account where he suggested that “the advice bossa nova gives is to make people live. After all, we were all leftists. We were all imprisoned by the military dictatorship.”\textsuperscript{64} The preceding analyses of “Sabiá” and “Ligia” offer evidence of Jobim’s political engagement, even while his status as a famed composer, conductor, and arranger, and what was perceived as his irreducible association with the first generation bossa nova innovators, protected him from the eyes and ears of the censors. The international success of bossa nova was viewed positively by the Brazilian authorities, and Jobim’s songs represented the definition of sophistication, good taste, and the Brazilian product-for-export \textit{par excellence}. He had established himself well before 1964 and was therefore not a product of the protest song movement, nor was his career a product of the Song Festival era of the 1960s, and for these reasons, Jobim was never considered a threat to the government. But while he did not have the same overt political involvement as other (younger) artists, this does not mean he was uninvolved. Perhaps Jobim’s greatest contribution to the protest song movement was the very sophistication of his songs: the way he would manipulate tonal materials to emphasize textual double meanings, or to color a lyrical passage that seems to mean one thing but that hides a deeper, more important interpretation, or to shift temporal perspectives by delaying (or erasing altogether) harmonic resolution in the service of drawing the listener’s attention to the multiple meanings imbued in some particular bit of text. Jobim and his best lyricist collaborators (Buarque, Vinicius de Moraes, Newton Mendonça) created endlessly interpretable polysemic artworks, and in these collaborations with the known political activist Chico Buarque, a subversive political interpretation is revealed through the specific ways that Jobim’s subtle attention to harmonic detail inflects and informs the lyrical line.

\textsuperscript{63} See above: it is also telling that when Jobim recorded his own version of “Ligia,” he used Buarque’s lyrics.

APPENDIX: SONG LYRICS
TRANSLATIONS BY IRNA PRIORE AND CHRIS STOVER

“Roda viva” (Chico Buarque)

Tem dias que a gente se sente [there are days that we feel like]
Como quem partiu ou morreu, [someone that left and died]
A gente estancou de repente [we suddenly stopped]
Ou foi o mundo então que cresceu... [or it was the world that grew up]

A gente quer ter voz ativa [we want to have an active voice]
No nosso destino mandar, [and control our own destiny]
Mas eis que chega a roda viva [but the wheel of life comes]
E carrega o destino prá lá... [and takes our destiny away]

Roda mundo, roda gigante, [the world spins, the Ferris wheel spins]
Roda moinho, roda pião, [the wind mill spins, the top spins]
O tempo rodou num instante [time swirled in an instant]
Nas voltas do meu coração... [in the spinning of my own heart]

A gente vai contra a corrente [we go against the flow]
Até não poder resistir, [until we can no longer resist]
Na volta do barco é que sente [when the boat comes back]
O quanto deixou de cumprir... [we know how little it had gone forward]

Faz tempo que a gente cultiva [for so long we cultivate]
A mais linda roseira que há, [the most beautiful rose bush there is]
Mas eis que chega a roda viva [but the wheel of life comes]
E carrega a roseira prá lá... [and takes the rose bush away]

Roda mundo, roda gigante
Roda moinho, roda pião
O tempo rodou num instante
Nas voltas do meu coração...

A roda da saia mulata [the spinning of the mulata’s skirt]
Não quer mais rodar não senhor, [does not want to spin anymore, no sir]
Não posso fazer serenata [I cannot serenade no longer]
A roda de samba acabou... [the samba circle is over]

A gente toma a iniciativa [we take the initiative]
Viola na rua a cantar, [we take our guitar into the streets to sing]
Mas eis que chega a roda viva [but the wheel of life comes]
E carrega a viola prá lá... [and takes the guitar away]

Note that “we” (a gente) here is intended as “the people” and has important ramifications of solidarity as it subtends the poor, the working class, the workers’ party, farmers, laborers, etc. This is an important Latin American trope; c.f. Hector Lavoe’s “Mi gente,” Tommy Olivencia’s “Hecho Palante,” and countless other examples.
Roda mundo, roda gigante
Roda moinho, roda pião
O tempo rodou num instante
Nas voltas do meu coração...

O samba, a viola, a roseira
Que um dia a fogueira queimou,
Foi tudo ilusão passageira
Que a brisa primeira levou...

No peito a saudade cativa
Faz força pro tempo parar,
Mas eis que chega a roda viva
E carrega a saudade prá lá ... 

Roda mundo, roda gigante
Roda moinho, roda pião
O tempo rodou num instante
Nas rodas do meu coração...(4x)

“Caminhando (Prá não dizer que não falei das flores)” (Geraldo Vandré)

Caminhando e cantando e seguindo a canção, [Walking and singing and following the song]
Somos todos iguais, braços dados ou não. [We are all the same, whether we join hands or not]
Nas escolas, nas ruas, campos, construções, [In the schools, streets, fields, and construction sites]
Caminhando e cantando e seguindo a canção. [Walking and singing and following the song]

Vem, vamos embora que esperar não é saber. [Come, let's go; waiting is not wise]
Quem sabe faz agora não espera acontecer. [The wise one acts now; not waiting for something to happen]

Pelos campos a fome em grandes plantações. [Through the fields, there is hunger in great farms]
Pelas ruas marchando indecisos cordões, [Through the streets, the undecided march]
Ainda fazem da flor seu mais forte refrão, [And make the flower their most powerful refrain]
E acreditam nas flores vencendo canhão. [And they believe the flowers are winning over the cannons]

Há soldados armados, amados ou não. [There are armed soldiers, they are loved or not]
Quase todos perdidos de armas na mão. [They are all lost, but with guns in their hands]
Nos quartéis lhes ensinam uma antiga lição, [In the military academies they teach an old lesson]
De morrer pela pátria e viver sem razão. [To die for the country and live without reason]

Nas escolas, nas ruas, campos, construções...

Os amores na mente, as flores no chão, [Love on our minds, flowers on the ground]
A certeza na frente, a história na mão. [Certainty is ahead, history at hand]
Caminhando e cantando e seguindo a canção, [Walking and singing and following the song]
Aprendendo e ensinando uma nova lição. [Learning and teaching a new lesson]
“Canção do exílio” (Gonçalves Dias)

Minha terra tem palmeiras
Onde canta o sabiá.
As aves que aqui gorjeiam
Não gorjeiam como lá.

Nosso céu tem mais estrelas,
Nossas várzeas têm mais flores.
Nossos bosques têm mais vida,
Nossa vida mais amores.

Em cismar, sozinho, à noite,
Mais prazer encontro eu lá.
Minha terra tem palmeiras,
Onde canta o sabiá.

Minha terra tem primores,
Que tais não encontro eu cá;
Em cismar, sozinho, à noite,
Mais prazer encontro eu lá.
Minha terra tem palmeiras,
Onde canta o sabiá.

Não permita Deus que eu morra
Sem que eu volte para lá,
Sem que desfrute os primores
Que não encontro por cá;
Sem qu’inda aviste as palmeiras
Onde canta o sabiá.

“Sabiá” (Antônio Carlos Jobim and Chico Buarque)

Vou voltar!
Sei que ainda vou voltar
Para o meu lugar
Foi lá e é ainda lá
Que eu hei de ouvir
Cantar uma Sabiá...

[My land has palm trees]
[Where the wood-thrush sings]
[The birds that sing here]
[Don't sing like they do there]
[Our skies have more stars]
[Our valleys have more flowers]
[Our woods have more life]
[Our life has more passion]
[In dreaming, alone, at night]
[More pleasure I find there]
[May God not allow me to die]
[before I return]
[Before I can delight in the beautiful things]
[that I don't find here]
[Without seeing the palm tree]
[Where the wood-thrush bird sings]
[I will return]
[I know that I will return]
[to my place]
[that was there, and it is still there]
[that I shall hear]
[A wood-thrush sing]
Vou voltar!
Sei que ainda vou voltar
Vou deitar à sombra
De uma palmeira que já não há,
Colher a flor que já não dá.
E algum amor
talvez possa espantar
As noites que eu não queria
E anunciar o dia...

Vou voltar!
Sei que ainda vou voltar
Não vai ser em vão
Que fiz tantos planos
De me enganar,
Como fiz enganos
De me encontrar,
Como fiz estradas
De me perder,
Fiz de tudo e nada
De te esquecer...

“Ligia,” original version (Antônio Carlos Jobim)

Eu nunca sonhei com você,
Nunca fui ao cinema,
Não gosto de samba,
Não vou a Ipanema,
Não gosto de chuva,
Nem gosto de sol.

Eu nunca te telefonei
Para que se eu sabia
Eu jamais tentei,
E jamais ousaria,
As bobagens de amor
Que aprendi com você,
Não, Ligia, Ligia

Sair com você de mãos dadas
Na tarde serena,
Um chope gelado
Num bar de Ipanema,
Andar pela praia até o Leblon.

Eu nunca me apaixonei,
Eu jamais poderia
Casar com você.

I will lay down in the shadow
(of a palm tree that no longer exists)
[I will harvest the flower that did not grow]
[And maybe, a love affair]
[the unwanted nights]
[And announce a new day]
[it will not be in vain]
[that I made so many plans]
[to fool myself]
[like mistakes I made]
[in order to find myself]
[like roads I opened]
[to lose myself]
[I tried everything and nothing]
[could make me forget you...]
[I never dreamed about you]
[I never went to the movies]
[I don’t like samba]
[I don’t go to Ipanema]
[I don’t like rain]
[nor do I like the sun]
[I never called you]
[because I knew]
[I would never try]
[I would never dare]
[the foolish things of love]
[that I learned from you]
[oh, no, Ligia]
[I’d go out with you holding hands]
[in a tranquil afternoon]
[a cold beer]
[in an Ipanema bar]
[strolling on the beach to Leblon]
[I never fell in love]
[I never could have]
[married you]
Fatalmente eu iria
Sofrer tanta dor
Pra no fim te perder,
Lígia, Lígia.

Você se aproxima de mim
Com esses modos estranhos,
E eu digo que sim,
Mas seus olhos castanhos
Me metem mais medo,
Que um raio de sol,
Lígia, Lígia...

“Lígia,” second version (with adapted lyrics by Chico Buarque)

Eu nunca sonhei com você,
Nunca fui ao cinema,
Não gosto de samba,
Não vou a Ipanema,
Não gosto de chuva,
Nem gosto de sol.

E quando eu lhe telefonei
Desliguei, foi engano.
O seu nome eu não sei.

As bobagens de amor
Que eu iria dizer.
Não, Lígia, Lígia.

Eu nunca quis tê-la ao meu lado,
Num fim de semana,
Um chope gelado,
Em Copacabana
Andar pela praia até o Leblon.

E quando eu me apaixonei
Não passou de ilusão.
O seu nome rasguei.

Fiz um samba-canção
Das mentiras de amor
Que aprendi com você,
Lígia, Lígia.

E quando você me envolver
Nos seus braços serenos
Eu vou me render,
Mas seus olhos morenos
Me metem mais medo
Que um raio de sol,
Lígia, Lígia...
REFERENCES


DISCOGRAPHY\textsuperscript{66}


Gil, Gilberto. 1968. \textit{Gilberto Gil}. Philips R 765.024 L.


Leão, Nara. 1965. \textit{O canto livre de Nara}. Philips P 632.748 L.


Vandré, Geraldo. 1979. \textit{Pra não dizer que não falei das flores (Caminhando)}. RGE Discos 301.0235.

\textsuperscript{66} While this discography lists original LP releases, all of these are easily findable on CD or through digital distribution.